

Summary of responses to public consultation on the Draft Local List for Maldon

Date and source of comments	Summary of comments	Response
3/7/2019 Prof. Diane Montgomery, owner of Nos 19, 21 & 23 Butt Lane	'Very pleased and honoured' for Nos 19, 21 & 23 Butt Lane to be included. Provided additional notes on the history of the building and photographs taken during renovation.	Thanked for positive comments and useful information. List entry amended accordingly.
18/7/2019 Dorreen Linton on behalf of the Maldon Society	Congratulations on 'an excellent list showing the variety of historic assets Maldon has to offer'.	Thanked for positive comments.
18/7/2019 Dorreen Linton	Suggested additional entries on the list: The Maldon Millenium Embroidery in Maeldune Heritage Centre. The Jolly Sailor at the Hythe The wooden sundial on the Plume Library	Thanked for suggestions. As the embroidery is not a structure, it would not qualify This is already grade II listed This is protected by the grade I listing of library
15/8/2019 David Coe, owner of 61 High Street	Advised that 'Coes have no comment or objection. Thank you for your efforts'	Noted
13/8/2019 David Gent, NHS	Request longer to submit comments in relation to St Peter's Hospital	Extension of deadline permitted until the 23 rd of August
23/8/2019 Angela Schembri, Planning Director RPS Group, on behalf of Mid Essex Hospital Services NHS Trust Letter reproduced in full on the following page.	In relation to the St Peter's Hospital: 'our view is that whilst a number of buildings within the hospital complex do meet the criteria for local listing, this does not apply to the all the buildings within the hospital complex, or even the entirety of the buildings that do meet the criteria', Request that the local listing includes the main range, Cherry Trees Resource Centre and the chapel, but excludes the less prominent buildings to the rear. Request inclusion of a plan showing precisely which buildings are included.	As per recommendation the local list will include a map showing which buildings on the hospital site are included in the designation. It is proposed to include all of the original workhouse structure on account of their architectural and historic interest.

Our ref: AS/24647



Date: 23 August 2019

20 Farringdon Street
London, EC4A 4AB
T +44 20 3691 0500

Mr Tim Howson
Maldon District Council
Princes Road
Maldon
Essex
CM9 5DL

Dear Mr Howson,

RESPONSE TO CONSULTATION ON THE DRAFT LIST OF LOCAL HERITAGE ASSETS IN MALDON (JUNE 2019)

Further to your letter dated 2nd July 2019 advising of the Draft Local List for Maldon and the opportunity to comment, please find below our response on behalf of our client the Mid Essex Hospital Services NHS Trust (MEHT).

As planning and heritage consultants, we have been instructed by our client to review the Draft Local List and provide comments on its contents insofar as it relates to St. Peter's Hospital in Maldon. In summary, our view is that whilst a number of buildings within the hospital complex do meet the criteria for local listing, this does not apply to the all the buildings within the hospital complex, or even the entirety of the buildings that do meet the criteria.

We therefore request the text within the Draft Local List be amended to limit the local listing to three specific buildings – namely the principal building (with the clock tower) and Cherry Trees Resource Centre, as shown on the attached map. The inclusion of the Chapel is not challenged. We would also request inclusion of the attached map in the local list document for the avoidance of doubt.

These conclusions and subsequent request are based on the following assessment.

Background Information

St Peter's Hospital has been proposed for inclusion within the List of Local Heritage Assets in Maldon, which is currently a draft for consultation purposes. The associated Chapel is also proposed for inclusion. This follows the preliminary Local List (2012) which included these buildings for local listing. St Peter's Hospital is a large complex of nineteenth and twentieth-century buildings located between Spital Road and Highlands Drive to the west of Maldon's historic core. It was originally developed in 1873 as the Maldon Workhouse, before becoming an NHS Hospital in the twentieth century. The latter part of the twentieth century has seen extensive alteration to the complex, including the construction of a number of new buildings to the rear of the original Victorian range.

The original Victorian buildings of the Hospital are located within the Maldon Conservation Area, while the western extent of the site is excluded from the Conservation Area. The Conservation Area Appraisal (2006) highlights the principal Victorian range of the Hospital, which includes the clock tower as a 'major landmark' (pages 19 and 22) with Figure 71 identifying the principal Hospital building, and all extensions, and the Cherry Trees Resource Centre (administration block) as 'Positive' buildings in the Conservation Area. The Chapel is

Our ref: AS/24647

also identified as a Positive building, albeit of a higher order. The remainder of the buildings within the site are identified as 'Neutral'.

Previous Assessment Work

NHS Mid Essex have previously commissioned Savills to provide a detailed 'Significance Assessment' (2012) for the St. Peter's Hospital site which provided an appraisal of the history of the Hospital and an assessment of its significance. This is a comprehensive document and a summary of the relevant parts is provided below.

- The original workhouse buildings have 'considerable' local historical value and form a local heritage asset, when considered as a whole
- This is principally due to their historic use and community function, rather than their intrinsic architectural merit
- Elements of the buildings and site are of lesser significance
- Although the rear ranges are originally and represent the intended plan form, they are generally of lesser historic and architectural interest than the principal range
- The twentieth-century extensions and additions are of no historic or architectural interest

The Savills document stated that the buildings were included in the preliminary Local List and were considered to be non-designated heritage assets by Maldon District Council. They have now been proposed for inclusion in the current draft Local List which is currently subject to public consultation.

The Draft Local List

The local list entry includes the following description:

This hospital complex was erected as the Maldon Poor Law Union Workhouse in 1873 to designs by Frederick Peck. It was constructed by a local builder, Ebenezer Saunders. It is built from red brick with stock brick bands and arches. It has a symmetrical front of three storeys, punctuated by short projecting gabled wings, with a central clock tower. Several of the original rear ranges also survive.

This is an accurate description of the principal and original hospital building. However, the precise extent of the listing is not apparent from the draft document. Due to the references to the 'original ranges' it is assumed that the local listing only applies to the principal range and the Victorian ranges to the rear of this, although this is not clear, and no plan is included in the local list document to confirm this.

The Chapel is described as follows:

This chapel was built in 1873, to designs by Frederick Peck, to serve the Maldon Poor Law Union Workhouse. It is constructed of London Stock bricks with red brick banding and has stone lancet windows and doorways. The roofs are covered in clay tiles. It is composed of a nave and an eastern apse. The building was used as mortuary during World War II.

The criteria for local listing (included on page 2 of the Draft Local List) states that the following are key considerations for determining whether a building is worthy of local listing:

- Age and integrity

Our ref: AS/24647

- Historic interest
- Architectural interest

Each of these points are expanded on in the document with more precise criteria provided for each of them. Although these criteria differ slightly from those proposed by Historic England in HEAN7: Local Heritage Listing, they do relate to the criteria for selecting listed buildings and are considered appropriate for the purposes of identifying and selecting buildings of local interest.

Discussion and Assessment

The principal building and extensions date from 1873 and can be considered as 'reasonably complete and of good local architectural and historic interest' as confirmed by the Savills report. They therefore meet the criteria established by the Council. They also relate to the historic and social development of Maldon and possess architectural interest. The principal building and rear ranges therefore appear to meet the criteria and are worthy of inclusion in the local list. However, it should be noted that elements of these, such as the Girls' Laundry and Kitchen are of little inherent interest but do complement the wider hospital complex and aid the understanding of its historic interest and original plan form.

The Savills report also refers to the administration block which sits at the sites entrance as being good significance. Whilst part of the original hospital complex the building has been heavily altered in the 20th Century and has limited significance and is not as high a value as the principal building or chapel.

As identified in the Savills report there are a high number of later extensions and new build elements which were constructed by the NHS in the late twentieth century. These are of no architectural or historic interest and in some instances are determinantal to the significance of the Victorian ranges.

The Chapel was constructed in 1873 as an integral part of the wider asylum. It now serves a variety of community uses and is identified as a landmark building in the Conservation Area Appraisal. As an integral part of the original asylum, it is considered to be of local significance and meets the criteria set out in the Draft Local List document.

We therefore have the following recommendations, which we wish to be taken into consideration and the list amended where necessary when finalising the local list entry:

- Alteration to listing title to clarify that the local listing refers just to the principal building
- All buildings located outside of the Conservation Area should be excluded from the local listing
- All twentieth-century buildings (indicated on the Plans on Pages 60, 62 and 64 of the Savills report) should be excluded from the local listing
- All twentieth-century extensions to the principal buildings (indicated on the Plans on Pages 60, 62 and 64 of the Savills report) should be explicitly excluded from the local listing
- All single-storey twentieth-century extensions (not shown in the Savills report, but including the Former Boys' School and Workshops, the Dining Hall and the Laundry) should be excluded from the local listing
- The Cherry Trees Resource Centre/Administration should be excluded from the local listing

Our ref: AS/24647

- A plan should be included to identify the buildings that are included on the Local List and the extent to which the local listing applies to each building (see below and at Appendix A)

We would also ask that consideration is given to the exclusion of the Victorian rear ranges. Although it is accepted that these form part of the original complex and complement the principal building, they are of little architectural interest and have limited historic interest in their own right. Further information is provided on the plan provided as **Appendix A** which provides a mark-up of the buildings of higher significance (the landmark, original Victorian range), those of lower significance (the Victorian rear ranges) and those of no significance. We would ask that this is taken into consideration when finalising the local listing.

Please do not hesitate to contact me to discuss the above.

Yours sincerely,
for RPS Consulting Services Ltd

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Angela Schembri', with a stylized flourish extending from the end.

Angela Schembri
Planning Director
schembria@rpsgroup.com